Title: Regarding allegations made by a Member of Parliament against the Leader of Opposition.

1220 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at twenty minutes

past Twelve of the Clock.

(Mr. Deputy-Speaker *in the Chair)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please hear me.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please hear me.

...(*Interruptions*)

12.21 hrs.

(At this stage Shri Sunderlal Tiwari and some hon. Members came and stood near the Table)

श्री मोहन रावले (मुम्बई दक्षिण मध्य) : उपाध्यक्ष जी, माननीय मंत्री की नियुक्ति करना प्रधान मंत्री जी का अबाध अधिकार है और माननीय राट्रपति महोदय जी ने उनको शपथ दिलाई थी। इसलिए ये लोग राट्रपति महोदय का अपमान कर रहे हैं। â€¦ (व्यवधान) राज्य सभा में आपका नेता उनको मान लेता है तो क्या आप अपने राज्य सभा के नेता को नहीं मानते हैं।â€¦ (व्यवधान) राज्य सभा में रास्ता निकालने के लिए बैठे हैंâ€¦ (व्यवधान) उपाध्यक्ष जी, यहां ये लोग क्यों राजी नहीं है?â€¦ (व्यवधान)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Will you please hear me, Shri Mohan Rawale?

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now, the hon. Speaker is having a discussion with the leaders to find out a solution for this.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 1245 hours.

12.22 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till forty-five minutes

past Twelve of the Clock.

12.47 hrs.

(The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Forty Seven minutes

past twelve of the Clock)

(MR. SPEKER in the Chair)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं माननीय सदस्यों को बताना चाहूंगा कि सदन की दृटि से विचार करते हुये, जो विाय यहां शुरु हुआ था, उस विाय पर मैं श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह जी को बोलने के लिये मौका दे रहा हूं।

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह (महाराजगंज, बिहार) : माननीय अध्यक्ष जी, आपसे मेरी आपके कार्यालय कक्ष में बात हुई है। आपने कहा कि मैंने जो बात कही, उसका प्रमाण मैंने नहीं दिया। आपने मुझे आश्वासन दिया है कि वह प्रमाण देने के बाद बहस की इजाजत सदन में मिलेगी। चूंकि मैं इस उम्मीद पर अपनी बात को वापस लेता हूं, मैं वह प्रमाण कल आपके समक्ष प्रस्तुत करूंगा। सदन में ,उन सवालों पर जिसमें मैंने मूर्ति चोरी का आरोप लगाया है, उस पर बोलने की इजाजत देंगेâ€¦ (व्यवधान)

श्री कांतिलाल भूरिया (झाबुआ) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह ठीक नहीं हैâ€¦ (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Let me talk to him.

Any issue in the House can be raised provided it is given with sufficient substance. Any Member can raise any issue and if I am convinced that the issue deserves to be raised, I will definitely permit. But in the meantime, as you have said, if you are expressing your apologies on the issue that you have raised, then the matters can be resolved. Am I right?

SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL (LATUR): Sir, you had suggested that this matter should be resolved and enough indication was given by the Chief Whip of the Congress Party as to what can be done in the matter. In spite of that, if any hon. Member is making irrelevant allegations, unsubstanted allegations, it does not raise the prestige of this House and if that is allowed such kind of allegations can be made with substance against the Members. If this is allowed against one Member, it should be allowed against other Members also.

You have very rightly said that it has to be convincing to you and we believe in your judgement and we abide what you have said. Yet, we would like to warn the Member that if untoward, unnecessarily unsubstantiated statements are made, they shall be asked to face substantiated allegations against them also.

MR. SPEAKER: Right.

डॉ.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आपने मामले को सुलझाने की बात की है। राज्य सभा में भी कल बात हुई थी, यहां भी बात हुई है। हमने भी बहुत सी बातें उस पक्ष से कहनी है, जो कुछ होता रहा है। विपक्ष के उपनेता वार्निंग न देते तो अच्छा होता। वार्निंग अपने मैम्बर्स को दें तो ज्यादा अच्छा होगा, जो हर रोज अनसब्सटेन्शिएटिड, अनडिमोक्रेटिक चार्जेज लगातार लगाते रहते हैं। हम यह चाहते हैं कि बिना किसी प्रूफ के और जब तक आप परमीशन न दें, तब तक ऐसा न हो। उसमें रूल है कि किसी मिनिस्टर या किसी भी मैम्बर पर कोई भी चार्ज लगाना हो तो उससे पहले नोटिस देना चाहिए। वह आपको नोटिस दें, नोटिस के बाद यदि आप कंविन्स हो जाए तो आप उसकी परमीशन दें। उसके बिना यहां चार्जेज नहीं लगने चाहिए। हम इस बात से पूरी तरह से सहमत हैं और इसीलिए इन्होंने

यह विदड्रा भी कर लिया है कि वह बाद में आपके सामने अपनी बात रखेंगे। परंतु यह बात कहनाâ€¦ (व्यवधान) मैं यह भी चाहता हूं कि कांग्रेस पार्टी के लोग या दूसरी पार्टियों के लोग जो दिन-रात बिना बात, बिना आपको कोई प्रूफ दिये हुए लगातार चार्जेज लगाते रहते हैं, वह भी उचित नहीं है। उस पर भी वे संयम रखें।â€¦ (व्यवधान)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : विपक्ष के उपनेता ने चेतावनी शब्द का इस्तेमाल किया है, इसलिए हम उस पर कुछ कहना चाहते हैं। विपक्ष के उपनेता ने अपने बोलने के क्रम में कहा है कि हम माननीय सदस्य को चेतावनी देना चाहते हैं। हम इस संबंध में अपनी बात कहना चाहते हैंâ€¦ (व्यवधान) क्या हम उनके मैम्बर हैं जो वह हमें चेतावनी देंगे, क्या हमें पार्टी से निकाल देंगे? वह चेतावनी कांग्रेस के मैम्बर्स को दें, हमें क्यों दे रहे हैं। हम उनकी चुनौती स्वीकार करने के लिए तैयार हैं। वह चेतावनी न दे अगर चेतावनी देंगे तो प्रतिदिन उन्हें मेरी चेतावनी सुननी पड़ेगी। हम उनकी एक-एक चुनौती को स्वीकार करने के लिए तैयार हैं।

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Shri Jaipal Reddy.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: We are discussing an important issue in the House. Please co-operate. After all, we want to transact the business in the House.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (MIRYALGUDA): Sir, we thank you for the initiative you have taken. Today, we are not discussing the rules afresh. The Member concerned made certain comments which were objected to by the Members and faulted by the Chair, and the Member wanted to withdraw those remarks. Sir, is there anything called `conditional withdrawal', 'qualified apology'? We do not have to remind the House of our rights. Every Member has his rights. So, if the apology is to be accepted by the Chair or by the House or by the Members who objected to his remarks, the apology must be graceful and it should be unqualified. It should not be linked to some conditions.
...(*Interruptions*)

श्री प्रभुनाथ सिंह : हमने कोई क्षमा नहीं मांगी और हम उस बात के लिए क्षमा मांगने के लिए तैयार भी नहीं हैं।â€¦ (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: He is withdrawing his remarks.

...(*Interruptions*)

श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी (खजुराहो) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह क्षमा मांगने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं। â€¦ (व्यवधान)

अगर इनका यह एटीट्यूड है तो फिर यह हमसे किस बात की उम्मीद रखते हैं।â€¦ (व्यवधान) यह आपके आदेश का पालन नहीं कर रहे हैं।â€¦ (व्यवधान) आपके निर्देशों का पालन भी नहीं कर रहे हैं।â€¦ (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Jaipal Reddy is on his legs. Let him complete.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Sir, no Member needs to refer to the rules in this connection. The remarks made by the Member earlier in the day were faulted by the Chair, objected to by the Members. There is a general sense in the House. He must pay heed to that general sense in the House and withdraw the remarks in an unqualified way. There should be no conditional or qualified apology. Sir, we would like to state in all humility that he has not complied with your directive. Therefore, we cannot be expected to be satisfied with that kind of withdrawal, with that kind of apology. I request him, through you, Sir, to gracefully withdraw his remarks without any conditions.

MR. SPEAKER: Let me make it clear that the whole issue started because the hon. Defence Minister was obstructed while replying to a Question asked in the House. I am indeed happy that the Opposition, particularly the Congress Party leaders also agreed that on this issue, we can discuss the matter. My desire has been that this issue is pending for a long time. It can be resolved. It would be in the interest of proper conduct of the House. Therefore, we have also thought of meeting this evening and discuss the issue.

If we can satisfy each otherâ€”we means, the Opposition and the Ruling Partyâ€”the remark, which has created this problem, can be also removed. So, with this intention, the whole exercise by me was started. The intention is that in this

very important House, the supreme body of Legislature in the country, we conduct the business in the best possible manner. I hope that everybody will agree with this.

Regarding the words which were used by Shri Prabhunath Singh while participating in a discussion, he has agreed to withdraw the words. This is not a conditional withdrawal. The only thing is that whatever allegation he wants to make, if it is as per rules, he can give a notice.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: So it was a discussion between me and him. He can always give me a notice. I will go through it. I will see the documents which he has got and if I am convinced, he can raise the issue.

As rightly said by Shri Shivraj Patil, if your Party also wants to raise certain issues, you are also allowed to raise those issues. In the meantime, he has withdrawn his words.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : No, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to submit in all humility that the Member in this context should withdraw without any qualification.

...(*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैंने आपको इजाज़त नहीं दी है। आप प्लीज़ बैठिये, मैंने जयपाल रेड्डी जी को बोलने की इजाज़त दी है ।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I would not speak without your permission.

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Jaipal Reddy, what I am bringing on record is that he has withdrawn the words.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : We want to differ from you. We would like to beg to submit to you that his withdrawal was so heavily qualified and it was full of such innuendoes and insinuations that it is not a withdrawal. If that is to be considered an apology, then the word will undergo a change. Therefore, you kindly direct him to withdraw the remarks that he has made earlier in the day unconditionally. Let him withdraw unconditionally.

श्री रघुनाथ झा (गोपालगंज) : ये आपको निर्देश कैसे दे सकते हैं?â€¦ (व्यवधान)

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : How can he direct you, Sir?

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Will you all please sit down? There are two parts of the issue. One part is that he has asked my permission to come with a notice if he has enough documents.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let me complete. That is what we discussed. To that I have said all right.

Now another question is that in the House he has already said that he has withdrawn.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, he has withdrawn and I am bringing it on record. In your presence he has withdrawn the words.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI (RAIGANJ): Sir, I will take half a minute. With all humility at my command, I may remind the House that there was a debate...(*Interruptions*)

श्री रघुनाथ झा : ये चार ही सदस्य हैं बोलने वाले?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं नहीं, मैं आपको भी मौका दूंगा।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Mr. Speaker, Sir, there was a debate on Gujarat in the last Session. Our leader was speaking here. The Treasury Benches objected to a remark made by Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar. The Deputy-Speaker gave a direction to Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar to withdraw it. Our leader directed Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar that it is Parliament and its dignity is supreme. He stood up, expressed his unqualified apology and the remark was withdrawn.

13.00 hrs.

That was how we stood by Parliamentary traditions. Today, if I have understood you correctly, your observation was that if there was something wrong in the proceedings from this side or from that side, you would examine it and delete appropriately. But in the case of Shri Prabhunath Singh, he should withdraw his remarks without any condition. He has said that he is withdrawing his remarks on an assurance. ...(*Interruptions*) Is it a dignified way? ...(*Interruptions*)

श्री लाल मुनी चौबे (बक्सर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मामला आपने शुरू किया और विवाद इन्होंने शुरू किया। मैं आपके ध्यान में लाना चाहता हूं कि हैल्थ मिनिस्टर को एक जवाब देना था, उन्हें जवाब नहीं देने दिया गया। सच बात मैं आपको याद दिलाऊं कि राज्य सभा में कांग्रेस के नेता श्री मनमोहन सिंह ने मान लिया और फिर उनका उत्तर सुना गया, लेकिन यहां लोक सभा में दो महीने हो गए हैं और रक्षा मंत्री का प्रश्न-काल में उत्तर नहीं सुना जा रहा है। â€¦ (व्यवधान)

श्री सुन्दर लाल तिवारी (रीवा) : अगर बात नहीं सुनी गई तो क्या इस तरह के शब्दों का प्रयोग होगा।â€¦ (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : चौबे जी, आप बैठिए। मैंने आपको बोलने की इजाजत नहीं दी है। If you want to speak one sentence, please speak one sentence and sit down. If you want to give a lecture, I cannot give you the permission. मैंने प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा जी को बोलने की अनुमति दी है।

...(*Interruptions*)

श्री लाल मुनी चौबे : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या कांग्रेस पार्टी में राज्य सभा और लोक सभा में कोई समन्वय नहीं है, क्या दोनों जगह कांग्रेस पार्टी में कोई समन्वय है, साम्यता है या नहीं ? यहां दोनों आपस में डटे हुए हैं। क्या मन मोहन सिंह जी श्रीमता गांधी से बात नहीं करते ? जबकि मामला यहां नहीं है। मामला बहुत पीछे है। â€¦ (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय, माननीय रक्षा मंत्री महोदय जब 1996 में यहां आए थे, तब इन्होंने एक प्रस्ताव किया था कि देश के महत्वपूर्ण और बड़े पदों पर ऐसे व्यक्तियों को न बैठाया जाए, जो भारत में पैदा नहीं हुए हों।â€¦ (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : प्लीज बैठिए। यह आप क्या कह रहे हैं। मैं समझ नहीं रहा हूं।

...(व्यवधान)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : If this is the way they behave, how can we be expected to co-operate? ...(*Interruptions*)

13.03 hrs.

(At this stage shri Sunderlal Tiwari and some other hon. Members came and stood near the Table)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 2 p.m.

13.03 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen of the Clock.

14.00 hrs

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Fourteen of the Clock.

(Mr. Speaker *in the Chair*)

MR. SPEAKER: I put it on record that Shri Prabhunath Singh has unconditionally withdrawn the words. Therefore, I go ahead with the further business of the House.

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Papers to be Laid on the Table of the House.